

Chapter 7

Discussion, Conclusions and Recommendations

7.1 Need and Significance of the Study

There are quite a number of researches done in the field of bilingualism and its effects in the teaching/learning of a second language. The researcher has provided some of those studies for reference in the review of earlier literature to present the various aspects of the current study. This was to set a clear picture of how the present study was different from that of the others. Many institutional bodies have focused on the language proficiency and fluency only at the Tertiary Level. But the problems involved in learning the L2 should be treated at the Primary Level itself. This instigated the researcher to consider focusing on the Primary Level Second Language learners in the present study. The researcher has incorporated Vygotsky's Social Constructivist theory to study the Second Language learners' development of language in the context of their social status. Also the Additive Bilingual Approach was adopted for the study as it was believed to help the learners to learn the target language with the help of their mother tongue. This approach retained the mother tongue (L1) Tamil while learning the English (L2). The current study focused on both cognitive and communicative development of the Primary Level ESL learners. Instead of directly focusing on the language skills the present study aimed at the cognitive aspects which would eventually help the learners to pick up the target language; in other words, the study aimed at attaining improved cognition (Understanding and Remembering) that will motivate the learners to be comfortable to use English and this would eventually enhance their communication skills to a great extent.

7.2 Statement of the Problem

The present study aimed at testing the efficacy of Additive Bilingual Approach in improving the cognition and communication of the Primary Level ESL learners of the Tamil Nadu State Government schools, with reference to their cognition. The study is therefore titled “Cognition and Communication – Efficacy of Additive Bilingual Approach to Teaching English as a Second Language at the Primary Level”.

7.3 Objectives of the Study

The objectives of the current study were listed as follows:

- To make the learners understand the content in their textbook using the Additive Bilingual Approach and activities catering to their ability to recall, recognize, list, describe, retrieve, name and find information.
- To make the learners remember the content in their textbook using the Additive Bilingual Approach and activities catering to their ability to explain ideas/concepts, to interpret, summarize, paraphrase, classify and explain.
- To initiate and enable social interaction among the learners with the help of activities that involve both the learners and the teacher, and sometimes, people outside the school.
- To improve the learners’ range of potential for learning, that is, Zone of Proximal Development (ZPD), by making them participate in various activities that involve both the learners and the teacher, and sometimes, people outside the school.
- To use L1(Tamil, in this case) as a ‘scaffolding’ device in teaching L2 (English) to help the learners improve their Listening, Speaking and Reading skills in English.

7.4 Hypotheses of the Study

7.4.1 Hypotheses

- There will be a significant difference enabled by the Additive Bilingual Approach in the learners' understanding and remembering of the English language
- There will be a significant difference enabled by the Additive Bilingual Approach in the learners' Listening, Speaking and Reading skills

7.4.2 Null hypotheses

- There will not be any significant difference enabled by the Additive Bilingual Approach in the learners' understanding and remembering of the English language
- There will not be any significant difference enabled by the Additive Bilingual Approach in the learners' Listening, Speaking and Reading skills

7.5 Research Methodology

7.5.1 Methodology of the Research

Mixed Method Research approach has been used in the present study as it helped the researcher to produce evidence for the validity of research outcomes, by converging quantitative and qualitative data. This Mixed Methods Research, according to Zoltan Dornyei (2007), “involves different combinations of qualitative and quantitative research either at the data collection or at the analysis levels. Typical example: consecutive and interrelated questionnaire and interview studies” (24)

7.5.2 Variables of the Study

For purposes of quantification and validation the Additive Bilingual Approach was taken as an Independent Variable and Cognition and Communication were taken as Dependent Variables.

7.5.3 Experimental Method

The present study has made use of the random sampling method. The samples were selected from the schools allotted by the Coimbatore District Educational Office for this research study. Considered for its better feasibility, Quasi-experiment method was followed for conducting the intervention study. In this method the entire population of the class was taken as samples.

7.5.4 Tools Used in the Study

The SPSS statistical assessment software was used to assess the data analytically. The statistical tools used to assess the data collected from the Pre-test and Post-test were:

- Mean and Standard Deviation
- Paired Sample t-Test
- One-way ANOVA

7.5.5 Findings of the Study

School A

- The Post-test scores of school A in Speaking and in Reading comprehension show significant increase from that of the Pre-test. Therefore it is inferred that there is an improvement in both these language skills.
- The samples in this school have performed really well in the Speaking test. The Mean value of 21.46 from the One-way ANOVA for the assessment of Speaking is the highest score among the six schools taken for study. Yet they performed comparatively less in their Reading comprehension test. The Mean value of the One-way ANOVA for the assessment of Reading comprehension is 10.48.

- The Mean value of 15.88 in the One-way ANOVA, to assess the overall improvement in both the skills gives the second highest value among the six select schools.

School B

- The Post-test scores in Speaking and Reading comprehension have significantly increased. There is a statistically significant difference between the Pre-test and Post-test score in both language skills.
- The samples in this school performed really well in the Speaking test. The Mean value of the One-way ANOVA for the assessment of Speaking is 17.25. Also they performed well in their Reading comprehension test. The Mean value of the One-way ANOVA for the assessment of Reading comprehension is 13.71, which is the second highest score in Reading among the six select schools.
- The One-way ANOVA, to assess the overall improvement, including both the skills indicates the Mean value as 15.25 which is the fourth highest value among the six select schools.

School C

- The Post-test scores in Speaking and Reading comprehension have significantly increased. There is a statistically significant difference between the Pre-test and the Post-test score in both language skills.
- The samples in this school performed well in the Speaking test. The Mean value of the One-way ANOVA for the assessment of Speaking is 18.71, which is the second highest score among the six schools. Also they performed well in their Reading comprehension test. The Mean value of the One-way ANOVA for the

assessment of Reading comprehension is 12.67, which is the fourth highest score among the six select schools.

- The One-way ANOVA, including the Speaking and Reading skills to assess the overall improvement, indicates the Mean value as 15.35 which is the third highest value among the six select schools.

School D

- The Post-test scores in Speaking and Reading comprehension have significantly increased. Therefore there is a statistically significant difference between the Pre-test and Post-test scores in both language skills.
- The samples in School D performed well in the Speaking test. The Mean value of the One-way ANOVA for the assessment of Speaking is 17.06, which is the fourth highest score among the six schools. Also they performed well in their Reading comprehension test. The Mean value of the One-way ANOVA for the assessment of Reading comprehension is 14.97, which is the highest score among the six select schools.
- The One-way ANOVA, to assess the overall improvement, including Speaking and Reading skills indicates the Mean value as 15.96 which is the highest value among the six select schools.

School E

- The Post-test scores in Speaking and Reading comprehension have shown a significant increase. There is a statistically significant difference between the Pre-test and the Post-test scores in both the language skills.

- The samples in School E performed well in the Speaking test. The Mean value of the One-way ANOVA for the assessment of Speaking is 11.86. Yet they performed comparatively less in their Reading comprehension test. The Mean value of the One-way ANOVA for the assessment of Reading comprehension is 9.32.
- The One-way ANOVA, to assess the overall improvement, including both the skills indicates the Mean value as 10.59.

School F

- The Post-test scores in Speaking and Reading comprehension have a definite increase. There is a statistically significant difference between the Pre-test and the Post-test scores in Speaking and Reading.
- The samples in School F performed well in the Speaking test. The Mean value of the One-way ANOVA for the assessment of Speaking is 13.82. They also performed well in their Reading comprehension test. The Mean value of the One-way ANOVA for the assessment of Reading comprehension is 12.69, which is the third highest score among the six select schools.
- The One-way ANOVA, to assess the overall improvement, including both the skills indicates the Mean value as 13.16.

7.6 Inferences

- In all the six schools selected for the study, the learners performed better in Speaking than in Reading comprehension. This is probably because the Primary Level ESL learners generally tend to imitate what they listened to in a second language without any big inhibitions. Reading and answering the comprehension

questions was found difficult by them probably because they have not had proper training in reading.

- From the Paired Sample t-Test, it is evident that the Post-test scores in Speaking and Reading have increased significantly in all the six select schools. It is observed from the ANOVA table that the Post-test scores of the learners of all the six schools differ significantly from the Pre-test scores in Speaking and Reading comprehension.

The Posttest score of the experimental group has a moderate, if not, significant difference from the Pre Test in both Reading and Speaking skills than the Control Group. Hence the Additive Bilingual Approach used in the study was effective for the Primary Level ESL learners in the six government schools selected for the study. This was clearly shown in the statistical analysis.

The Reading test scores of the six select government schools are presented in the following order:

- 1) Edayarpalayam
- 2) Kalveerampalayam
- 3) Vadavalli (North)
- 4) Goundampalayam
- 5) Urumandampalayam
- 6) Vadavalli (South)

The Speaking test scores of the six select government schools are presented in the following order:

- 1) Edayarpalayam

- 2) Kalveerampalayam
- 3) Vadavalli (North)
- 4) Goundampalayam
- 5) Urumandampalayamand
- 6) Vadavalli (South)

The overall test scores, including both Reading and Speaking tests, of the six select government schools are presented in the following order:

- 1) Edayarpalayam
- 2) Kalveerampalayam
- 3) Vadavalli (North)
- 4) Goundampalayam and
- 5) Urumandamapalayam and
- 6) Vadavalli (South)

There is a significant difference in the scores between the Control Group and the Experimental Group ESL learners. The difference in the scores clearly shows the positive effect of using Additive Bilingual Approach in the Primary Level ESL classroom.

Using L1 as a Scaffolding tool significantly, if not, moderately improved the Listening, Reading and Speaking skills of the Experimental group students which is evident in the statistical analysis. There was no significant difference in the Post-test score of all the Control Groups in Reading skills. Yet there was significance at 5% level in the Post-test L1→L2 in Goundampalayamschool Control Group. This confirms the learners' ability to use the L1 (Tamil) to understand and learn the L2 (English). Also Additive Bilingual Approach improves this ability of the students to understand and

remember, and therefore, the use of L1 as a scaffolding tool to pick up the L2 in the present study is validated.

7.7 Validation of the Hypotheses

- **There will be a significant difference enabled by the Additive Bilingual Approach in the Primary Level ESL Learners' Understanding and Remembering of the English language.** This hypothesis is proved, as the Pre-test and Post-test questions were designed based on the two cognitive elements of Bloom's Taxonomy, i.e. understanding and remembering, and the Post-test score of the learners have increased significantly in Reading Comprehension which involves the same. Therefore the null hypothesis is rejected.
- **There will be a significant difference in the Primary Level ESL Learners' Listening, Speaking and Reading skills enabled by the Additive Bilingual Approach.** There is a significant difference between the Pre-test and Post-test scores of the learners in the six select schools in Speaking and Reading comprehension. The learners' Listening skill has also developed, which is inferred from the learners' performance in the classroom, their oral responses to the researcher's questions and instructions and is also evident in their Post-test score in Speaking. With better Listening the learners picked up words and put them into sentences to convey a message. Therefore this hypothesis is proved and the null hypothesis is rejected.

7.8 Limitations of the study

The present study is delimited to the area, method, technique, language skills focused, tools, and assumptions proposed for the study.

- The study was limited only to the Class IV learners at the Primary level of six Select State Government Schools in Coimbatore.
- The study focused only on three basic language skills: Listening, Speaking and Reading.
- The module prepared for the study was confined only to the Additive Bilingual Approach.
- The activities designed as part of the module have only used Vygotsky's Social Constructivist Theory.

7.9 Experimental Validity of the study

The schools taken for the study was randomly allotted by the Chief Educational Officer, Coimbatore. Accordingly the samples for the present study were selected based on random sampling method and the samples represent the primary level ESL learners of the Tamil Nadu State government schools in the semi-urban and rural social set up. The module and the activities prepared were based on the Additive Bilingual Approach in relation with Vygotsky's theory of Social Constructivism. However, the statistical results obtained from this present study prove that the Additive Bilingual Approach can be applicable at the Primary level ESL classroom. Yet the method applicable to one classroom might not be the same to the other. Therefore the results obtained through this present study are applicable to the Primary Level ESL Learners in the government schools in Tamil Nadu.

7.10 Educational Implications of the study

The present study clearly explains that with an effective method of teaching, the Primary Level government school ESL learners can easily pick up the target language, i.e. English. There are various aspects to be improved to attain this state. The following are some suggestions to enable the Primary Level ESL learners, in the government schools in Tamil Nadu, to pick up the target language:

- Due to lack of trained teachers recruited for teaching primary level students, teachers who have graduated in different subjects are assigned to teach English as a second language. This can be rectified by appointing teachers who are qualified in English language and have been trained to teach communicative skills in English need to be appointed.
- Teachers are to be encouraged to attend more language training programs so that they can implement different techniques for effective classroom teaching.
- Owing to the additional clerical, administrative work the ESL teachers have less time to focus on the language development of individual learners in their class. This may be avoided by granting more time for teaching.
- Communication between the parents and the teachers should be enabled through frequent informal Parents-Teachers meets to keep track of the learners' overall development.
- The education system in Tamil Nadu is exam-driven and the exams are conducted only through written mode, which encourages rote memorization. The highest scores in Part II English exams thus do not necessarily ensure better communicative competence in the students. The Oral test in English language for the Primary Level

students that is in practice now is also based on stock vocabulary and language structures. Speaking tests that are based on real life happenings and that prompt thinking before answering are to be developed and conducted.

7.11 Scope for further research

- An attempt may be taken to test the effectiveness of the Additive Bilingual Approach in the government/regional medium schools in other Indian states.
- A study can be conducted employing different Language Teaching Approaches to develop the ESL learners' cognition and communication at the Primary Level in the government schools.
- An attempt may be made to study whether the Additive Bilingual Approach would be useful at the Secondary or Tertiary levels of ESL teaching and learning.
- A study may be undertaken to investigate whether Additive Bilingual Approach could improve the Writing skills in English, at the Primary, Secondary and Tertiary levels.
- A study could be taken up to examine whether the Additive Bilingual Approach could be useful for the ESL learners at the private schools.
- A study may be made to observe the development of the learners' Cognitive Academic Language Proficiency while teaching through the Additive Bilingual Approach.